## CMU 15-781

## Lecture 11:

Markov Decision Processes II

Teacher:
Gianni A. Di Caro

## Recap: Defining MDPs

- Markov decision processes:
- Set of states $S$
- Start state $s_{0}$
- Set of actions $A$
- Transitions $\mathbf{P}\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)$ (or $\mathbf{T}\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)$ )
- Rewards $R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)$ (and discount $\gamma$ )
- MDP quantities so far:
- Policy $\pi=$ Choice of action for each state
- Utility/Value = sum of (discounted) rewards
- Optimal policy $\pi^{*}=$ Best choice, that max Utility


## Utility and Policy selection

- Utility of a state sequence (its return): sum of the discounted rewards obtained during the state sequence

$$
U\left(s_{t}\right)=U\left(\left[s_{t+1}, \ldots, s_{\infty}\right]\right)=\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{k} R\left(s_{t+k+1}\right)
$$

- Utility/return of the state sequence from current state $s_{t}$

$$
U\left(s_{t}\right)=U\left(\left[s_{t+1}, \ldots, s_{\infty}\right]\right)=\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{t} R\left(s_{t+k+1}\right)
$$

- The rational agent tries to select actions so that the sum of the discounted rewards it receives over the future is maximized (i.e., its utility is maximized)


## Utility and Policy selection

- State/reward sequences depend on applied policy $\pi$, and effects of probabilistic transitions $\mathrm{P}\left(\mathrm{s}^{\prime} \mid \mathrm{s}, \pi(\mathrm{s})\right)$ on actions
- $\rightarrow$ Rational agent aims to find the action policy $\pi^{*}$ that maximizes the expected value of the utility for all $s_{0} \in S$



## Value function and Q-Function

- The value $\boldsymbol{V}^{\pi}(s)$ of a state $s$ under the policy $\pi$ is the expected value of its return, the utility of all state sequences starting in $s$ and applying $\pi$

$$
V^{\pi}(s)=E\left[\sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{t} R\left(s_{t}\right) \mid s_{0}=s\right]
$$

State
Value-function

- The value $Q^{\pi}(s, a)$ of taking an action $a$ in state $s$ under policy $\pi$ is the expected return starting from $s$, taking action $a$, and thereafter following $\pi$ :

$$
Q^{\pi}(s, a)=E\left[\sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{t} R\left(s_{t}\right) \mid s_{0}=s, a_{0}=a\right] \text { Action } \text { Value-function }
$$

## Value function

$$
\begin{aligned}
V^{\pi}(s) & =E\left[\sum_{t=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{t} R\left(s_{t+1}\right) \mid s_{0}=s\right] \\
& \rightarrow E\left[\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{k} R\left(s_{t+k+1}\right) \mid s_{t}=s\right] \\
& =E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma R\left(s_{t+2}\right)+\gamma^{2} R\left(s_{t+3}\right)+\ldots\right] \\
& =E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \gamma^{k} R\left(s_{k+t+2}\right) \mid s_{t}=s\right] \\
& =E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s_{t+1}\right) \mid s_{t}=s\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## BELLMAN EQUATION FOR VALUE FUNCTION

$$
\begin{aligned}
V^{\pi}(s) & =E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s_{t+1}\right) \mid s_{t}=s\right] \\
& =\sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S
\end{aligned}
$$

- Expected immediate reward (short-term) for taking action $\pi(s)$ prescribed by $\pi$ for state $s+$ Expected future reward (long-term) get after taking that action from that state and following $\pi$


## BELLMAN EQUATION FOR VALUE FUNCTION

State $s$

$$
V^{\pi}(s)=\sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S
$$

Backup diagram

- Additivity of utility +
- Markov property
- Relation between the value of a state and that of its neighbors
- Recursive state equations that need to be mutually consistent



## BELLMAN EQUATION FOR Value function

$$
V^{\pi}(s)=\sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S
$$

- How do we find $V$ values for all states?
- $|S|$ linear equations in $|S|$ unknowns


## Values for the grid world states

| 3 | 0.812 | 0.868 | 0.918 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0.762 |  | 0.660 | $\boxed{+1}$ |
| 1 | 0.705 | 0.655 | 0.611 |
|  |  |  |  |

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \gamma=1, \mathrm{R}(\mathrm{~s})=-00.4
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { ( } \pi \text { is also optimal) }
\end{aligned}
$$

## A golf club example



- Value of a state: negative of the number of strokes to the hole from that location
- Actions: which club to use $\{$ putter, driver $\}$
- Policy: only use the putter


## Optimal state and ACTION VALUE FUNCTIONS

- $V^{*}(s)=$ Highest possible expected utility from $s$

$$
V^{*}(s)=\max _{\pi} V^{\pi}(s) \quad \forall s \in S
$$

- Optimal action-value function:

$$
Q^{*}(s, a)=\max _{\pi} Q^{\pi}(s, a) \quad \forall s \in S, a \in A
$$

## Optimal Action-Value example

$q_{*}(s$, driver $)$

-2

- Optimal action-values for choosing club=driver, and afterward select either the driver or the putter, whichever is better.


## BELLMAN OPTIMALITY EQUATIONS FOR $V$

- The value $V^{*}(s)=V^{\pi^{*}}(s)$ of a state $s$ under the optimal policy $\pi^{*}$ must equal the expected utility for the best action from that state $\rightarrow$

$$
\begin{aligned}
V^{*}(s) & =\max _{a \in A(s)} Q^{\pi^{*}}(s, a) \\
& =\max _{a \in A(s)} E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s_{t+1}\right) \mid s_{t}=s, a_{t}=a\right] \\
& =\max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Bellman optimality equations for V

$V^{*}(s)=\max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S$

- $|\mathrm{S}|$ non-linear equations in $|\mathrm{S}|$ unknowns
- The vector $\boldsymbol{V}^{*}$ is the unique solution to the system


Carnegie Mellon University 15

## BELLMAN OPTIMALITY EQUATIONS FOR $Q$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& Q^{*}(s, a)= E\left[R\left(s_{t+1}\right)+\gamma \max _{a^{\prime}} Q^{*}\left(s_{t+1}, a^{\prime}\right) \mid s_{t}=s, a_{t}=a\right] \\
&= \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma \max _{a^{\prime}} Q^{*}\left(s^{\prime}, a^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
& \forall s \in S, a \in A
\end{aligned}
$$

- $|\mathrm{S}| \times|\mathrm{A}(\mathrm{s})|$ non-linear equations
- The vector $Q^{*}$ is the unique solution to the system


Carnegie Mellon University 16

## Finding the optimal policy

- If we have computed $V^{*} \rightarrow$
$\pi^{*}(s)=\arg \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime}} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]$
It's one-step ahead search
$\rightarrow$ Greedy policy with respect to $V^{*}$
- If we have computed $\boldsymbol{Q}^{*} \rightarrow$

$$
\pi^{*}(s)=\arg \max _{a \in A(s)} Q^{*}(s, a)
$$

$$
=\arg _{a \in A(s)} \max _{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma \max _{a^{\prime}} Q^{*}\left(s^{\prime}, a^{\prime}\right)\right]
$$

## Optimal V* FOR The grid world

$V^{*}(s)=\max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]^{3}$
For our grid world (find that up is the best), Let's omit the rewards, assuming $\mathrm{R}=0$ :

- $\mathrm{V}^{*}(1,1)=\gamma \max \{u, l, d, r\}[$


$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\left\{0.8 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,2)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(2,1)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,1)\right\}, & \text { up } \\
\left\{0.9 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,1)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,2)\right\}, & \text { left } \\
\left\{0.9 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,1)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(2,1)\right\}, & \text { down } \\
\left\{0.8 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(2,1)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,2)+0.1 \mathrm{~V}^{*}(1,1)\right\} & \text { right }
\end{array}
$$

## $\mathrm{V}^{*}$ FOR RECYCLING ROBOT

Two states $\{$ high, low $\}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
v_{*}(\mathrm{~h}) & =\max \left\{\begin{array}{l}
p(\mathrm{~h} \mid \mathrm{h}, \mathbf{s})\left[r(\mathrm{~h}, \mathbf{s}, \mathrm{~h})+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})\right]+p(\mathrm{l} \mid \mathrm{h}, \mathbf{s})\left[r(\mathrm{~h}, \mathbf{s}, 1)+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{l})\right], \\
p(\mathrm{~h} \mid \mathrm{h}, \mathrm{w})\left[r(\mathrm{~h}, \mathrm{w}, \mathrm{~h})+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})\right]+p(1 \mid \mathrm{h}, \mathrm{w})\left[(\mathrm{h}, \mathbf{w}, \mathrm{l})+\gamma v_{*}(1)\right]
\end{array}\right\} \\
& =\max \left\{\begin{array}{l}
\alpha\left[\left[_{\mathbf{s}}+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})\right]+(1-\alpha)\left[r_{\mathbf{s}}+\gamma v_{*}(1)\right],\right. \\
{\left[r_{\mathbf{w}}+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})\right]+\left[r_{\mathbf{w}}+\gamma v_{*}(1)\right]}
\end{array}\right\} \\
& =\max \left\{\begin{array}{l}
r_{\mathbf{s}}+\gamma\left[\alpha v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})+(1-\alpha) v_{*}(1)\right], \\
r_{\mathbf{w}}+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})
\end{array}\right\} . \\
v_{*}(1) & =\max \left\{\begin{array}{l}
\beta r_{\mathbf{s}}-3(1-\beta)+\gamma\left[(1-\beta) v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})+\beta v_{*}(1)\right] \\
r_{\mathbf{w}}+\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{l}), \\
\gamma v_{*}(\mathrm{~h})
\end{array}\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

## How do we solve the Bellman OPTIMALITY EQUATIONS?

$$
V^{*}(s)=\max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{*}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S
$$

- $|\mathrm{S}|$ non-linear equations in $|\mathrm{S}|$ unknowns (because of max)
- Equations suggest an iterative, recursive update approach

$$
V_{k+1}(s) \leftarrow \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \quad \forall s \in S
$$

State Backup: $\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}+1}=\boldsymbol{B} \boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}}$

## Value Iteration

## 1. Initialization:

Initialize arbitrarily $V(s) \forall s \in S$ (e.g., $V(s)=0$ )
2. Value Iteration:

Repeat
$\Delta \leftarrow 0$
$k \leftarrow 0$
Foreach $s \in S$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& v \leftarrow V(s) \\
& V_{k+1}(s) \leftarrow \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

Bellman update / Backup operator

$$
\Delta \leftarrow \max (\Delta,|v-V(s)|)
$$

$$
k \leftarrow k+1
$$

Until $\Delta<\theta$ (small positive number) estimation error (see later)
Output a deterministic policy $\pi \approx \pi^{*}$, such that

$$
\pi(s)=\arg \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]
$$

## Value Iteration on Grid World

$\mathrm{R}(\mathrm{s})=0$
everywhere except at the terminal states

$$
\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}}(\mathrm{~s})=0 \text { at } k=0
$$



$$
\begin{aligned}
& V_{k+1}([i, j]) \leftarrow \max [] \\
& \max \left[\left\{p([i+1, j] \mid[i, j], u)\left(R([i+1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i+1, j])\right)+p([i-1, j] \mid[i, j], u)\left(R([i-1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i-1, j])\right)+\right.\right. \\
& p([i, j+1] \mid[i, j], u)\left(R([i, j+1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j+1])\right)+p([i, j-1] \mid[i, j], u)\left(R([i, j-1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j-1])\right)+ \\
& \left.p([i, j] \mid[i, j], u)\left(R([i, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j])\right)\right\}_{u p}, \\
& \left\{p([i+1, j] \mid[i, j], d)\left(R([i+1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i+1, j])\right)+\right. \\
& p([i-1, j] \mid[i, j], d)\left(R([i-1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i-1, j])\right)+p([i, j+1] \mid[i, j], d)\left(R([i, j+1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j+1])\right)+ \\
& \left.p([i, j-1] \mid[i, j], d)\left(R([i, j-1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j-1])\right)+p([i, j] \mid[i, j], d)\left(R([i, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j])\right)\right\}_{\text {down }}, \\
& \left\{p([i+1, j] \mid[i, j], r)\left(R([i+1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i+1, j])\right)+\right. \\
& p([i-1, j] \mid[i, j], r)\left(R([i-1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i-1, j])\right)+p([i, j+1] \mid[i, j], r)\left(R([i, j+1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j+1])\right)+ \\
& \left.p([i, j-1] \mid[i, j], r)\left(R([i, j-1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j-1])\right)+p([i, j] \mid[i, j], r)\left(R([i, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j])\right)\right\}_{r i g h t}, \\
& \left\{p([i+1, j] \mid[i, j], l)\left(R([i+1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i+1, j])\right)+\right. \\
& p([i-1, j] \mid[i, j], l)\left(R([i-1, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i-1, j])\right)+p([i, j+1] \mid[i, j], l)\left(R([i, j+1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j+1])\right)+ \\
& \left.\left.p([i, j-1] \mid[i, j], l)\left(R([i, j-1])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j-1])\right)+p([i, j] \mid[i, j], l)\left(R([i, j])+\gamma V_{k}([i, j])\right)\right\}_{l e f t}\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Value Iteration on Grid World

| $0.00 \vee$ | $0.00 \vee$ | $0.72 \vee$ | 1.00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $0.00 \vee$ |  | 0.00 | -1.00 |
| $0.00 \vee$ | $0.00 \vee$ | $0.00 \vee$ | 0.00 |
|  |  |  |  |

VALUES AFTER 2 ITERATIONS


VALUES AFTER 3 ITERATIONS

## Value Iteration on Grid World



VALUES AFTER 4 ITERATIONS

| 0.51 | 0.72 | 0.84, | 1.00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0.27 |  | 0.55 | -1.00 |
|  | 0.00 | 0.22 | 0.37 |
| 0.13 |  |  |  |

VALUES AFTER 5 ITERATIONS

## Value Iteration on Grid World

| 0.64 | 0.74 > | 0.85 | 1.00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| - |  | $\triangle$ |  |
| 0.57 |  | 0.57 | -1.00 |
| - |  | - |  |
| 0.49 | 40.43 | 0.48 | 4 0.28 |

VALUES AFTER 100 ITERATIONS


VALUES AFTER 1000 ITERATIONS

## Computational Cost for 1 Update of $V(S)$ For all $S$ In Value ItERATION?

- For all states $s$

$$
\begin{gathered}
V_{k+1}(s) \leftarrow \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
|\mathbf{A}| \cdot|\mathbf{S}|^{2}
\end{gathered}
$$

## Does Value Iteration converge?

- Yes, it does converge to a unique solution, $\boldsymbol{V}^{*}$
- It does because a backup operation $\mathbf{B}$ is a contraction by a factor $\gamma$ on the space of the state value vectors:
- If apply B to two different value functions, their max norm distance shrinks

$$
\max \text { norm: }\|\boldsymbol{V}\|=\max _{s \in S}|V(s)|
$$

$\left\|\boldsymbol{V}-\boldsymbol{V}^{\prime}\right\|=$ max difference between two corresponding states

$$
\Downarrow
$$

$$
\left\|\boldsymbol{B} \boldsymbol{V}_{k}-\boldsymbol{B} \boldsymbol{V}_{k}^{\prime}\right\| \leq \gamma\left\|\boldsymbol{V}_{k}-\boldsymbol{V}_{k}^{\prime}\right\|
$$

## Bellman Operator is a Contraction

 $\left|\left|\mathrm{V}-\mathrm{V}^{\prime}\right|\right|=$ Infinity norm (find max difference over all states, e.g. $\max (\mathrm{s})\left|\mathrm{V}(\mathrm{s})-\mathrm{V}^{\prime}(\mathrm{s})\right|$$$
\left\|B V-B V^{\prime}\right\|=\left\|\max _{a}\left[R(s, a)+\gamma \sum_{s, \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right) V\left(s_{j}\right)\right]-\max _{a^{\prime}}\left[R\left(s, a^{\prime}\right)-\gamma \sum_{s_{j}, \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a^{\prime}\right) V^{\prime}\left(s_{j}\right)\right]\right\|
$$

$$
\leq \max _{a}\left\|\left[R(s, a)+\gamma \sum_{s_{j} \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right) V\left(s_{j}\right)-R(s, a)+\gamma \sum_{s_{j} \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right) V^{\prime}\left(s_{j}\right)\right]\right\|
$$

$$
\leq \gamma \max _{a}\left\|\left[\sum_{s_{j} \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right) V\left(s_{j}\right)-\sum_{s_{j} \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right) V^{\prime}\left(s_{j}\right)\right]\right\|
$$

$$
=\gamma \max _{a} \|\left[\sum_{s, j \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right)\left(V\left(s_{j}\right)-V^{\prime}\left(s_{j}\right)\right)\right]
$$

$$
\leq \gamma \max _{a, s_{i}} \sum_{s_{s, \in S}} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right)\left|V\left(s_{j}\right)-V^{\prime}\left(s_{j}\right)\right|
$$

$$
\leq \gamma \max \sum_{a, s_{i}} \sum_{s_{j} \in S} p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, a\right)\left\|V-V^{\prime}\right\|
$$

Holds for $\gamma<1$
$=\gamma\left\|V-V^{\prime}\right\|$

## Properties of Contraction

- Only has 1 fixed point (the point reach if apply a contraction operator many times)
- If had two, then would not get closer when apply contraction function, violating definition of contraction
- When apply contraction function to any argument, value must get closer to fixed point
- Fixed point doesn't move
- Repeated function applications yield fixed point


## Value Iteration Converges

- Value iteration converges to unique solution which is the optimal value function
- Proof: $\quad \lim _{k \rightarrow \infty} V_{k}=V^{*}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left\|V_{k+1}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} & =\left\|B V_{k}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} \leq \gamma\left\|V_{k}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} \leq \ldots \\
& \leq \gamma^{k+1}\left\|V_{0}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} \rightarrow 0
\end{aligned}
$$

## Convergence rate?

- $\left\|\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}}-\boldsymbol{V}^{*}\right\|=$ error in the estimate $\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}}$, therefore by using the previous relation:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left\|V_{k+1}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} & =\left\|B V_{k}-V *\right\|_{\infty} \leq \gamma\left\|V_{k}-V *\right\|_{\infty} \leq \ldots \\
& \leq \gamma^{k+1}\left\|V_{0}-V^{*}\right\|_{\infty} \rightarrow 0
\end{aligned}
$$

- $\rightarrow$ Error is reduced by a factor of at least $\gamma$ on each iteration $\rightarrow$ Error decreases as $\gamma^{\mathrm{N}}$ after N iterations
$\rightarrow$ Exponentially fast convergence


## Convergence rate?

- \#Iterations to reach an error bound $\varepsilon$ ?
- Utilities of all states are bounded by $\pm \mathrm{R}_{\max } /(1-\gamma)$ (this is the sum of the geometric series representing the utility)
- $\rightarrow$ Maximum initial error: $\varepsilon_{0}=\left\|\boldsymbol{V}_{0}-\boldsymbol{V}^{*}\right\| \leq 2 \mathrm{R}_{\max } /(1-\gamma)$
- After N iterations: $\varepsilon_{\mathrm{N}} \leq \gamma^{\mathrm{N}} 2 \mathrm{R}_{\text {max }} /(1-\gamma)$
- The \#iterations to have an error of at most $\varepsilon$ grows with $\gamma$ :

$$
N=\left\lceil\log \left(2 R_{\max } / \epsilon(1-\gamma)\right) / \log (1 / \gamma)\right\rceil
$$

- N grows rapidly as $\gamma$ is selected to be close to 1


## Convergence in the grid world




## BELLMAN UPDATE ERROR AND $\theta$

- Question: how do we set $\theta$ in the termination condition?
- Previous error bounds, that are quite conservative and might not be a good indicator on when to stop
- A better bound relates the error $\left\|\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}+1}-\boldsymbol{V}^{*}\right\|$ in $\boldsymbol{V}$ to the size $\left\|\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}+1}-\boldsymbol{V}_{\mathrm{k}}\right\|$ of the Bellman update at each iteration: If $\left\|V_{\mathrm{k}+1}-V_{\mathrm{k}}\right\|<\varepsilon(1-\gamma) / \gamma \Rightarrow\left\|V_{\mathrm{k}+1^{-}} V^{*}\right\|<\varepsilon$
(Ronald J. Williams and Leemon C. Baird III. Tight performance bounds on greedy policies based on imperfect value functions. Technical Report NU-CCS-93-14, 1993)
- $\Rightarrow$ A good choice is: $\theta=\varepsilon(1-\gamma) / \gamma$, based on desired $\varepsilon, \gamma$


## Policy Loss

- Question: do we really need to wait for convergence in the value functions before to use the value functions to define a good (greedy) policy?
- $\left\|V^{\pi(k)}-V^{*}\right\|=$ Policy loss: the max the agent can lose by executing $\pi(k)$ instead of $\pi^{*} \rightarrow$ This is what matters!
- $\pi(k)$ is the greedy policy obtained at iteration $k$ from $V_{k}$ and $V^{\pi(k)}(s)$ is value of state $s$ applying greedy policy $\pi(k)$


## Policy Loss

- Using previous results for the bound, it can be shown that:

$$
\text { If }\left\|V_{k}-V^{*}\right\|<\varepsilon \Rightarrow\left\|V^{\pi(k)}-V^{*}\right\|<2 \varepsilon \gamma /(1-\gamma)
$$

- In practice, it often occurs that $\pi(k)$ becomes optimal long before $V_{k}$ has converged!

Grid World: After $k=4$, the greedy policy is optimal, while the estimation error in $V_{\mathrm{k}}$ is still 0.46


## Policy Iteration: Motivation

- Is the error in value function estimation really essential to extract the optimal policy? (which is what the agent needs)
- Not really, if one action (the optimal) gets really better than the others, the exact magnitude of the $V(s)$ doesn't really matter to select the action in the greedy policy (i.e., don't need "precise" V values), more important are relative proportions


## Policy Iteration

- Policy iteration, alternate:
- Policy evaluation: given a policy calculate the value of each state as that policy were executed
- Policy improvement: Calculate a new policy according to the maximization of the utilities using one-step look-ahead based on current policy
$\pi_{0} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{\pi_{0}} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{1} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{\pi_{1}} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{2} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} \cdots \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{*} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{*}$


## (Generalized) Policy Iteration

$\pi_{0} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{\pi_{0}} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{1} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{\pi_{1}} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{2} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} \cdots \xrightarrow{\mathrm{I}} \pi_{*} \xrightarrow{\mathrm{E}} v_{*}$


## (Iterative) Policy Evaluation

1. Initialization:

Input $\pi$, the policy to be evaluated
Initialize $V(s) \forall s \in S$ (e.g., $V(s)=0$ )
2. Policy Evaluation:

Repeat
$\Delta \leftarrow 0$
$k \leftarrow 0$
Foreach $s \in S$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& v \leftarrow V(s) \\
& V_{k+1}(s) \leftarrow \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
& \Delta \leftarrow \max (\Delta,|v-V(s)|) \\
& k \leftarrow k+1
\end{aligned}
$$

Until $\Delta<\theta$ (small positive number)
Output $\boldsymbol{V} \approx \boldsymbol{V}^{\boldsymbol{\pi}}$

## Analytic Solution is also possible!

$$
V^{\pi}(s)=\sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]
$$

Let $T^{\pi}$ be a $\mathrm{S} \times \mathrm{S}$ matrix where the $(\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j})$ entry is:

$$
\begin{gathered}
T^{\pi}\left(s_{i}, s_{j}\right)=p\left(s_{j} \mid s_{i}, \pi\left(s_{i}\right)\right) \\
\vec{V}=T^{\pi} \vec{R}+\gamma T^{\pi} \vec{V}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\vec{V}-\gamma T^{\pi} \vec{V}=T^{\pi} \vec{R}
$$

[Requires taking an

$$
\vec{V}=\left(1-\gamma T^{\pi}\right)^{-1} T^{\pi} \vec{R}
$$ inverse of a $S$ by $S$ matrix

$\mathrm{O}\left(\mathrm{S}^{3}\right)$

## Policy Improvement

- Suppose we have computed $V^{\pi}$ for a deterministic policy $\pi$
- For a given state $s$, is there any better action $a, a \neq \pi(s)$ ?
- The value of doing $a$ in $s$ can be computed with $Q^{\pi}(s, a)$
- If an $a \neq \pi(s)$ is found, such that $\mathrm{Q}^{\pi}(s, a)>\mathrm{V}^{\pi}(s)$, then it's better to switch to action $a$
- The same can be done for all states


## Policy Improvement

- $\rightarrow$ A new policy $\pi^{\prime}$ can be obtained in this way by being greedy with respect to the current $\mathrm{V}^{\pi}$

$$
\pi^{\prime}(s)=\arg \max _{a} Q^{\pi}(s, a) \quad \forall s \in S
$$

- Performing the greedy operation ensures that $\mathrm{V}^{\pi^{\prime}} \geq \mathrm{V}^{\pi}$
- $\rightarrow$ Monotonic policy improvement by being greedy wrt current value functions / policy
- If $V^{\pi^{\prime}}=V^{\pi}$ then we are back to the Bellman equations, meaning that both policies are optimal there is no further space for improment


## Monotonic Improvement in Policy

- For any two value functions $V_{1}$ and $V_{2}, \mathrm{~V}_{1} \geq \mathrm{V}_{2}$ $\leftrightarrow V_{1}(s) \geq V_{2}(s) \quad \forall s \in \mathrm{~S}$
- Proposition: $\mathrm{V}^{\pi} \geq \mathrm{V}^{\pi}$ with strict inequality if $\pi$ is suboptimal, where $\pi^{\prime}$ is the new policy we get from doing policy improvement (i.e., being onestep greedy)


## Proof

$V^{\pi}(s) \leq \max _{a} Q^{\pi}(s, a)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& =\sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi^{\prime}(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi^{\prime}(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
& \leq \sum_{s \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi^{\prime}(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi^{\prime}(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma \max _{a^{\prime}} Q^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime}, a^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
& =\sum_{r \in S^{\prime}\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi^{\prime}(s)\right)}\left[\begin{array}{l}
R\left(s, \pi^{\prime}(s), s^{\prime}\right)+ \\
\left.\sum_{s \in S} P^{\prime \prime}\left|s^{\prime \prime}\right| s^{\prime}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right)\left(R\left(s^{\prime}, \pi^{\prime}\left(s^{\prime}\right), s^{\prime \prime}+\gamma V^{\pi}\left(s^{\prime \prime}\right)\right)\right.
\end{array}\right] \\
& \ldots \leq V^{\pi^{\prime}(s)}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Policy Iteration

1. Initialization:
$V(s) \in \mathbb{R}$ and $\pi(s) \in A(s)$ arbitrarily for all $s \in S$
2. Policy Evaluation:

Repeat
$\Delta \leftarrow 0$
$k \leftarrow 0$
Foreach $s \in S$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& v \leftarrow V_{k} \\
& V_{k+1} \leftarrow \sum_{s^{\prime} \in S} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, \pi(s)\right)\left[R\left(s, \pi(s), s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V_{k}\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
& \quad \Delta \leftarrow \max \left(\Delta,\left|v-V_{k+1}(s)\right|\right) \\
& k \leftarrow k+1
\end{aligned}
$$

Until $\Delta<\theta$ (small positive number)
Output $\boldsymbol{V} \approx \boldsymbol{V}^{\pi}$

## Policy Iteration

3. Policy Improvement:
policy-stable $\leftarrow$ true
Foreach $s \in S$
old-action $\leftarrow \pi(s)$
$\pi(s) \leftarrow \arg \max _{a \in A(s)} \sum_{s^{\prime}} p\left(s^{\prime} \mid s, a\right)\left[R\left(s, a, s^{\prime}\right)+\gamma V\left(s^{\prime}\right)\right]$
If old-action $\neq \pi(s)$ policy-stable $\leftarrow$ false
If policy-stable
stop
return $\boldsymbol{V} \approx \boldsymbol{V}^{*}, \pi \approx \pi^{*}$
Else
Goto 2.

## Policy Iteration

Maintain value of policy Improve policy


Value Iteration
Keep optimal value for finite steps, increase steps


## Policy Iteration

Fewer Iterations
More expensive per iteration

$O\left(|\mathrm{~A}| \cdot|\mathrm{S}|^{2}\right)$ Improvement $O\left(\left||\mathrm{~S}|^{3}\right)\right.$ Evaluation
$\operatorname{Max}|\mathrm{A}|^{|S|}$ possible policies
to evaluate and improve

## Value Iteration

More iterations
Cheaper per iteration

$O\left(|\mathrm{~A}| \cdot|\mathrm{S}|^{2}\right)$ per iteration
In principle an exponential number of iterations to $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$

## MDPs: What You Should Know

- Definition
- How to define for a problem
- Value iteration and policy iteration
- How to implement
- Convergence guarantees
- Computational complexity

